

Purpose

The Genesee/Finger Lakes Regional Planning Council (G/FLRPC) was contracted by Clark Patterson Associates (CPA) to provide projections of the future residential, commercial, and industrial development resulting from the Livonia Gateway Park Road. These projections can be used to forecast future traffic volume conditions on the Livonia Gateway Park Road. This document defines the study area, details the methodology employed to produce the projections, and provides the estimates as well as when development in the study area is likely to occur by location and zoning district.

Study Area

The study area corresponds to properties affected by the Livonia Gateway Park Road as determined by CPA. The Livonia Gateway Park Road's southeastern entry point begins on Main Street in the Village of Livonia east of West Avenue. The road heads north across Stone Hill Road. The road turns to the west crossing Bronson Hill Road and connects with NYS Route 15 near the Town of Livonia's northwest border. Properties analyzed for this report were those bounded by West Lake Road (NYS Route 256) on the east, South Lima Road on the north, the Livonia, Avon, and Lakeville (LA&L) Railroad line on the west, and Big Tree Road/Main Street (NYS Route 15) north of Conesus Lake on the south.

Methodology

The following section describes the method and results of each of the steps taken by the G/FLRPC to produce the development projections. To project future residential, commercial, and industrial development in the study area, the G/FLRPC undertook a process that included:

1. Analysis of current development projections and past development activity.
2. Review of the Town and Village of Livonia's joint land use plans and zoning.
3. Assessment and visitation of the study area and its properties.
4. Consultation with local and county officials.
5. Production of development projections.

1. Analysis of current development projections and past development activity

CPA provided the G/FLRPC with the development projections for the Town and Village of Livonia it utilized as part of the draft of the Livonia Transportation and Access Management Plan in May 1999. The plan states:

“A review of historic growth trends and the land use designations from the Livonia Comprehensive Plan as shown in Figure 3 [omitted] indicate an estimated 1,000 new residences and 450,000 to 750,000 square feet of non-residential development is expected over the next 20 years. Nearly all of the non-residential development and a substantial portion of the residential development is expected to be located in the Village of Livonia and the quadrant of the town north of US 20A and west of Poplar Hill Road.”

These projections were used earlier in a traffic study completed by SRF & Associates for CPA in September 1997. The study states that historical numbers of new residential permits issued for a nine-year period were used to extrapolate that an additional 1,060 new residential units would be built over twenty years. A low estimate of non-residential development was provided by CPA at 450,000 square feet (sf) and distributed at 51% industrial, 15% business non-retail, and 34% business retail.

The G/FLRPC reviewed permitted new residential data for the ten-year period of 1991 to 2000 and the most recent three-year period of 1998 to 2000. The ten-year data was taken from the Census Bureau’s Division of Manufacturing, Mining, and Construction Statistics. Between 1991 and 2000, permits were issued for 372 single-family homes and 34 units in nine multi-family homes in the Town and Village of Livonia. Over 90 percent of the total number of units (375) as well as single-family residences (343) were permitted in the Town. Table 1 below presents the number of residential permits issued by type between 1991 and 2000 in the Town and Village of Livonia.

Table 1

		Number of Permits Issued for Single-Family (SF) and Multi-Family (MF) Residences in the Town and Village of Livonia, 1991 -2000																			
		1991		1992		1993		1994		1995		1996		1997		1998		1999		2000	
		SF	MF	SF	MF	SF	MF	SF	MF	SF	MF	SF	MF	SF	MF	SF	MF	SF	MF	SF	MF
Town of Livonia		56	2(4)	60	-	32	2(8)	34	1(8)	27	1(8)	33	-	26	-	30	2(4)	19	-	26	-
Village of Livonia		4	-	2	-	3	-	-	-	2	1(2)	2	-	4	-	4	-	4	-	4	-

Multi-family (MF) values are number of buildings (number of units)

Source: Census Bureau, Manufacturing, Mining, & Construction Statistics - Residential Construction Branch, 1991 - 2000

The three-year data (1998-2000) was taken from primary survey data collection done as part of the G/FLRPC's annual *Rural County Land Use Monitoring Report*. The two data sets were nearly identical in numbers of residential permits issued by type for the past three years. Based on the Census Bureau and G/FLRPC data, the number of new units being permitted over the past five years has averaged 31 new units of which 86% are in single-family residences. At this rate, the number of permits issued for residences in the Town and Village of Livonia over the next twenty-years would equal 620 new residences. This number of new residences is significantly less than the growth estimates used in the draft version of the comprehensive plan which most likely factored in the permit numbers issued in the early 1990's that were substantially higher.

In addition, permit data was also available for industrial and commercial buildings including square footage and type of commercial use. Between 1998 and 2000, there were 7 permits issued for retail service uses totaling 27,400 sq. ft., 1 for a 5,200 sq. ft office building, and none for industrial buildings. Non-residential square footage data extrapolated over twenty years yields a projected square footage less than half the low-estimate of 450,000 sq. ft. provided by CPA in the draft of the joint Town and Village comprehensive plan.

As with any projections based on historical data, it is assumed that demand for new housing units and land for non-residential uses will follow previous levels. However, given the larger amounts of development in municipalities to the north (Avon and Lima) and west (Geneseo), it is likely that Livonia and the study area in particular (because it borders these communities) will have increased development pressures in the future. In addition to serving the study area, the Livonia Gateway Park Road's impact on opening up properties for development via access points and the concomitant increase in the marketability of sites will also add to residential and non-residential development that will exceed historical levels. To determine whether or not CPA's current projections are still applicable to the amount of growth that will likely result, the G/FLRPC began an analysis of the Town and Village of Livonia's joint comprehensive plan and zoning.

2. *Review of the Town and Village of Livonia's joint land use plans and zoning.*

The Livonia Comprehensive Plan adopted in November 1996 includes numerous references to the western portion of the study area (north of the Hamlet of Lakeville and west of Bronson Hill Road) as an area where commercial and industrial development should be encouraged, particularly along NYS Route 15. Section 5 of the document is the Economic Development Plan for Livonia and includes the following:

“Existing land use and zoning patterns, the community survey, and locational attributes all point to Lakeville and the northwest quadrant of the town as the most appropriate locations for additional commercial and industrial development. All of the industrially zoned land and most of the undeveloped commercially zoned land in Livonia outside the village is located in the northwest quadrant. This economic development plan therefore focuses on this area as an economic development opportunity area.” (Page 5-2)

In terms of residential development, the comprehensive plan states that “[n]ew residential development should be encouraged in residentially designated area” as well as clustered in areas where public water and sewer are made available. The southeastern portion of the study area south of Stone Hill Road and east of Bronson Hill Road is discussed in the comprehensive plan as being “particularly appropriate” (page 3-9) for multi-family development because of its location between uses of gradually decreasing intensity and single-family locations.

Zoning districts in the study area include neighborhood residential, transitional development, industrial, shopping center district, commercial/limited industrial and gateway commercial. The G/FLRPC summarized the regulations for each of the aforementioned zoning districts and included the following:

- | | |
|------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| ✓ Permitted uses | ✓ Minimum front setback (ft.) |
| ✓ Special permit uses | ✓ Minimum rear setback (ft.) |
| ✓ Minimum lot area (sq. ft.) | ✓ Minimum side setback (ft.) |
| ✓ Maximum lot coverage (%) | ✓ Maximum height (ft.) |
| ✓ Minimum lot width (ft.) | ✓ Maximum number of stories |
| ✓ Minimum lot depth (ft.) | |

The information taken from the zoning regulations was used to calculate the numbers of new residential units and permissible non-residential square footage for parcels based on the results of the next step in the process.

3. Assessment and visitation of the study area and its properties.

The G/FLRPC utilized a geographic information system (GIS) to view and manipulate 1999 parcel centroid data from the NYS Office of Real Property Services. Each of the properties in the study area was mapped by its property classification code. The property classifications were:

- | | |
|----------------|------------------------------|
| ✓ Agricultural | ✓ Recreation & Entertainment |
| ✓ Residential | ✓ Community Service |
| ✓ Vacant | ✓ Industrial |
| ✓ Commercial | ✓ Public Services |

Maps were produced displaying each parcel centroid by classification code and vacant properties were highlighted on a parcel boundary map as well for use in the site visit conducted by the G/FLRPC. As stated above, the data contained in the maps was two years old. Therefore, the site visit was crucial to correcting omissions, changes, and errors due to incorrect reporting and changes between 1999 and the present. The site visit yielded significant information concerning the possible future development of the study area resulting from the accessibility that the Livonia Gateway Park Road will bring to properties.

4. Consultation with local and county officials.

While the data and information analyzed in the first three steps yielded insight regarding development pressures and possible future trends, the G/FLRPC felt it most important to consult with local and county officials to answer questions that had arisen and correct any errors in the information derived by the G/FLRPC thus far. The following individuals were contacted by and discussed future development projections with the G/FLRPC:

- Julie Marshall, Deputy Director - Livingston County Office of Economic Development
- Kevin Masterson, Director of Building & Zoning – Town & Village of Livonia
- Catherine Muscarella, Public Works Director – Livingston County Solid Waste Department
- Timothy Wahl, Supervisor – Town of Livonia
- David Woods, AICP, Planning Director – Livingston County Planning Department

Key findings resulting from the discussions regarding future development in the study area include:

- Livonia is a major development area in Livingston County. Subsequently, there has been a large amount of discussion at the community level regarding what is and is not appropriate development for Livonia.
- The Livonia Gateway Park Road will benefit not only residents of Livonia and those who work in Livonia but also persons from surrounding areas namely those enjoying the amenities of Conesus Lake. Recent construction work by the NYS Department of Transportation on a bridge on NYS Route 20A and subsequent rerouting of traffic required the presence of the Livingston County Sheriff's Department because of increased volume on neighboring roads.
- The coordination and continuity between Town and Village development efforts (including a joint comprehensive plan and zoning regulations) has a major effect on the siting of development projects within the community.
- The Livingston County Industrial Development Agency is actively marketing multiple properties within the study area. The 80-acre Cole Property that abuts the LA&L Railroad line is the most prominent of these. The former Pease property now owned by Chris Ramsey is adjacent to the Cole property and is another prime industrial area in Livonia. Sewer lines have been extended to the Ramsey property. A third property, owned by the Todd Family, is contiguous to the other two and is expected to see development along with the two aforementioned properties. This is the primary industrial area in Livonia and is expected to see development within the next five years.
- The transitional development district zoning classification was created to encourage mixed uses. The areas are, in general, expected to include a mix of half residential (with an even split between single and multi-family housing)

and a quarter each of commercial and open space. The commercial space is limited to operations of 2,000 square feet or less with the zoning ordinance listing “low-intensity professional office, service, retail, restaurant or bar use, including mini storage facilities” as acceptable conditional uses.

- The most immediate development (five years or less) is likely to occur in the area within and directly north of the village boundary west of Washington Street. The area contains three zoning districts: shopping center, gateway commercial, and transitional development.
- In addition to the locations above, the area zoned as a transitional development district along West Lake Road north of Lakeville Road (US 20A) is also expected to see development within the next five years.
- The transitional development district at the intersection of Stone Hill Road and Bronson Hill Road will most likely see development between five and 10 years from now. The Livonia Gateway Park Road is the determining factor in increasing the marketability of this site as it runs directly north of the district.
- The Livonia Gateway Park Road traverses the northeast quadrant of the study area east of Bronson Hill Road and north of Stone Hill Road. Although not currently served by water or sewer, more capacity can be added to the Conesus Lake County Sewer District and it is likely that this area (while no plans have been made as of yet) could have water, sewer, or both extended to it. For this reason the area, which is zoned as neighborhood residential has a time frame for development of more than ten years with 15 to twenty years being the most likely development period. It is interesting to note that, to date, a large portion of residential development has occurred to the south and east of the Village even in the absence of public and sewer and water provisions.

5. Production of development projections.

The initial step in developing the projections was the review of the adjusted RPS parcel centroid maps after the site visit to eliminate properties within the study area that presently have structures and improvements. These properties were eliminated from the Town and Village of Livonia’s tax maps and a review of the remaining parcels in the study area was conducted to determine available parcels for development by zoning district.

In addition, the map of NYS designated wetlands provided as part of the joint comprehensive plan was also reviewed to eliminate areas that would be prohibited from development as part of New York State's wetlands protection program. The sizes of the remaining parcels were recorded for each zoning district classification and aggregated to provide the total area available for development.

The total area available for development in each of the zoning districts in the study area was converted from acres to square feet and the Livonia zoning regulations' development standards were applied to the total area in each zoning district in the study area by location. The development standards applied to each of the zoning districts were as follows:

Neighborhood Residential (NR) – the minimum lot size of 15,000 sq. ft. for single-family dwellings with public water and sanitary sewer were applied to the NR districts north and west of the Village between the LA & L Railroad and Bronson Hill Road. The NR district south of Stone Hill Road and west of the Village is currently served by water and sewer and the remaining portion of the district is also likely to have water and sewer extended to it provided there is development interest. To account for two-family dwellings, the desire for larger lot sizes, and the possible absence of public water and sewer, the residential development projection used was sixty percent of the total number of single-family dwellings (units) that could be accommodated in a maximum build-out.

Transitional Development (TD) – these districts are being utilized to allow for mixed-use development between non-residential (primarily commercial) and residential districts. The TD districts were viewed as likely to retain a quarter of their total area as open space and have the remaining area developed equally as single-family, mutli-family, and commercial. The same standards for the NR districts were applied to the quarter of the total area being developed as single-family dwellings. For the multi-family dwellings, the 5,000 sq. ft. per unit zoning standard was applied for low-rise apartment complex housing types consisting of eight units. To account for differences in developer and renter preferences the use of sixty percent of the total build-out was applied to multi-family dwellings as it was to single-family dwellings.

The area that is projected to be commercial development was determined to be three-quarters of the available area. Three-quarters of the full area likely to be commercial development was used because the zoning states the conditional

use permits for non-residential uses "... should occupy less than 2,000 square feet;" (Code of the Town of Livonia & Code of the Village of Livonia). Keeping with the intended uses in the TD district, this portion of the zoning regulation all but eliminates any type of large retailer or office uses in the district thus reducing the total amount of land likely to be developed commercially. The thirty-percent maximum lot coverage mandated by the joint zoning regulations was applied to the remaining area and was split evenly between retail and non-retail uses.

Gateway Commercial (GC) – the thirty-five percent maximum lot coverage as stated in the zoning regulations was applied to the total area available for development. As with the TD District, the amount of space used for retail and non-retail commercial uses was split evenly.

Shopping Center (SC) – the thirty-percent maximum lot coverage allowed in this district was applied to the total area available for development in the SC districts. This space was then split with seventy-five percent being retail and the remaining twenty-five percent being non-retail commercial uses.

Commercial/Limited Industrial (C/LI) – the development in this district was split at 30% commercial and the remaining 70% industrial. The maximum lot coverage applied to the available space in the C/LI district was thirty-five percent.

Industrial (I) – the thirty-five percent maximum lot coverage was applied to the parcels within the I district to yield the maximum square footage of industrial space available for development under the zoning regulations.

Projections

The projections yielded by district as detailed above represent a full build-out scenario within the study area. However, it is highly unlikely that all of the available land open for development will in fact be developed over the next twenty years. As stated before, the proximity to I-390 and development trends to the north in Avon and Lima and to the west in Geneseo as well as emerging consumer and residential markets to the east indicate that Livonia and especially the study area will see increased development compared to historical levels.